

## Low-fidelity Simulations For. Assessment

Joseph Psotka
Peter Legree, Tiffany Bludau
Jim Belanich
ARI
ICT Oct. 4, 2008

# The Growing Edge of Change is where Development can be accelerated ... Velocity 0 m/yr -800 Whillans (B) **cuided** and scaffolded

Oct 2, 2008

## **Neither too advanced, Nor too elementary; Just right!**





Happy families are all alike; Every unhappy family is unhappy in its

own way

Many diverse opinions can be united into a better consensual whole ..many novices can combine to outperform an

expert

hebdő

ANNA MARCHINE

Oct. 2. 2008



LTC Dongle is meeting Achmed for the first time, and they are getting to know each other. Dongle knows that Achmed, a Shia, is an important busi

## **Situation Judgment Tests:** Low - Level Simulations

LTC Dongle is meeting Achmed for the first time, and they are getting to know each other. Dongle knows that Achmed, a Shia, is an important businessman with influence in this primarily Shiite area. To develop rapport with Achmed, what sorts of topics of conversation would be good for LTC Dongle to bring up during the meeting?





How much authority he has as a LTC in the US Army.	Poor Moderate Good
	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
How is one of the main reasons why there is still unrest in .	Poor Moderate Good
	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
How Achmed's family is doing these days.	Poor Moderate Good
	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
How much he enjoys the local food in this area.	Poor Moderate Good
비누는 그는 것은 것은 것은 것은 것은 것은 것은 것은 것은 것을 가지 않는 것이 같이 없다.	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

#### Average Scores on Situational Judgement Test (N=11)



Significant difference between pre- and post-test scores (paired samples t-test, df=10, t=-3.52, p=.0027)



## Initial Results for ELECT BiLAT Instruction



#### Instruction includes:

- Short lecture/presentation from course instructor (i.e., how to use BiLAT and goals for lesson)
- About 1 hour to use BiLAT (preparing and conducting simulated meetings with automated tutor/coach feedback)

#### Pre/Post-test (N=11)

- Situational Judgment Test (30 items) used to assess decisionmaking in bilateral negotiation situations.
- Agreement scores derived from correlations between student choices and SME scoring key.

#### **Results**

 Average pre-test agreement score = 0.79, average post-test agreement score = 0.88

 Significant increase from pre- to post-test scores (paired samples t-test, t(10)=3.52, p=.0028)

### TKML Vignettes



Tacit Knowledge of Military Leadership (TKML)
Developed by ARI and Yale University
Focus on Interpersonal Leadership skills
Validated for Platoon, Company, and Battalion

#### A platoon-level scenario:

You are a new platoon leader who takes charge of your platoon when they return from a lengthy combat deployment. All members of the platoon are war veterans, but you did not serve in the conflict. In addition, you failed to graduate from Ranger School. You are concerned about building credibility with your soldiers. What should you do?

# Knowledge Post: An On - Line Collaborative Learning Environment



- Knowledge Post is a standard threaded discussion environment that has been enhanced with LSA.
- Read notes including vignette description
- Write notes in response to those scenarios or prompts.
- Respond to vignette and notes of others
- Search for semantically similar notes
- Receive feedback on your contributions by the Intelligent Essay Assessor

# **Related Notes**



### **KNOWLEDGE POST**

Main Index | Search | Messages | Who's Online | Profile | Logout | Help

Riley1 >> Trouble in McLouth

Notes related to "Where's PAO?"								
Subject		Similarity (0-100)	Find Related		Author	Date		
2	<u>get out of the way</u> ភ្	(55)	<u>Notes</u>	<u>References</u>	leaderR8	06/03/02 09:17 AM		
2	FINAL THOUGH Halt	Halt all the convoy serials that have not		<u>References</u>	leaderR5	06/03/02 09:34 AM		
	Final METT-T enter	ered the congested areas and	try to ps	<u>References</u>	leaderR7	06/03/02 09:33 AM		
2	Final Thoughts. the	Brigade.	es es	<u>References</u>	leaderR8	06/03/02 09:36 AM		
2	re: First things First	(42)	<u>Notes</u>	<u>References</u>	leaderR8	06/03/02 09:30 AM		

 leaderR2
 06/03/02 09:12
 Where's PAO?
 Extension Related Library References

 AM
 First thing we need here at this scene is the PAO office with MP assistance standing by. Inform the commander of the following serials of the situation and get the company commander working on an alternate route. This will not be over quickly and we don't want the whole support unit stuck here.



# KP vs. Paper & Pencil

Collected responses from over 200 officers at different posts
Officers' responses graded by four military experts
Higher quality responses using KP
Demonstrable learning using KP

### **TLAC On-line:** Paper vs Knowledge Post for TLAC Across Ranks



Two forces appear to drive the superior performance and greater learning evidence in the online environment:

PEER PRESSURE: knowing that others will read and comment on one's solution produces more thoughtful and complete responses;





LEARNING FROM PEERS : reading and commenting, with automated assistance, on each other's notes produces a superior final solution over face-to-face.

# ZPD and Goldilocks Principle Perhaps Implemented in KP by LSA





Oct. 2, 2008

# ZPD and Goldilocks Principle Perhaps Implemented in KP by LSA

Frequencies of Note Grades and Near Notes in One Big KP Thread 35 30 25 20 Frequency Notes Near Notes 15 10 5 1.5 2 2.5 3 3.5 4.5 5 5.5 6 6.5 7.5 1 4 7 More

Oct. 2, 2008

Army Research Institute

Bin



The relationship between the top 25% of Cadets, the bottom 25%, and the Expert Senior Officers used to standardize the PLQ TKML, showing that the top 25% (selected using their own means) are practically indistinguishable as a group for setting the standards of the test.

Oct. 2, 2008

### Conceptualizing Consensus Based Measurement : Summary & Implications



- Expert and Examinee judgments will be correlated when the space of formative experiences and tacit knowledge is similar,
- This is equivalent to the expectation that when exposure to experiences and other knowledge is similar over levels of expertise,
  - **r**(expert,truth) > **r**(journeyman,truth) > **r**(novice,truth)
- Disagreement is expected when the distributions of exposure to either declarative knowledge or experiences is censored
  - Declarative Knowledge Expectations: Alcohol and crash involvement, Urban crime

Proscribed Experiences: Teen Smoking, Sexuality & Alcohol expectations

- Supports development of scales in domains lacking experts
  Provides economy to test development
- Explicitly invokes the concept of disagreement to understand knowledge structures



CPTs



## Online Leader Challenges Incorporating Multimedia



Oct.1, 2008

## Online Leader Challenges Likert Rating of Alternatives



Challenge #2 Leading in Combat Edit your course of action selection Pictures Your revised approach Use buttons below to Rest, get water, then continue on. view pictures from Select how much you agree or disagree with the location of taking the following courses of action: this challenge A. Listen to the Platoon Sergeant return to FOB « Prev | Next»  $\odot$ C C  $\mathbf{C}$  $\odot$ Video stronaly disagree neutral agree strongly disagree agree Click here to view B. Request that the commander clarify his task the Challenge Video and purpose  $\mathbf{O}$  $\mathbf{O}$  $\odot$  $\odot$  $\mathbf{O}$ strongly disagree neutral agree strongly Stream Video disagree agree C. Take a halt to rest the platoon  $\mathbf{C}$  $\odot$  $\mathbf{O}$  $\odot$  $\mathbf{C}$ strongly disagree neutral agree strongly

Oct.1, 2008



A comparison of pre and post-scores of USMA Cadets on Leadership SJTs scored against an expert standard.

Using the Cadet pre-test mean as the standard, the pre/post difference was still significant for LC2 and LC3 (t(32) = 4.38, p < .001). The important point is that a separate expert standard did not need to be derived to assess performance on this instrument: instead the scoring standard for this SJT can be derived using CBA algorithms for the Cadets themselves

Oct.1, 2008

1. When judgment data are collected using Likert scales, one approach to quantify individual differences is to correlate each set of respondent ratings with the scoring standard (i.e., item means).

2. These values can be computed by inverting the data matrix so that individuals correspond to columns and items to rows and then conducting a Q-factor analysis (Nunnally, 1967; Stephenson, 1935). The first set of component scores from a Principle Components Analysis (PCA) in this Q-factor analysis will correspond to the set of correlations of each individual with the scoring standard (i.e., mean ratings); we refer to these values as component scores.

3. Because this approach controls for respondent differences in the mean and variance of respondent ratings, these scores can be characterized as "scale-reduced." In contrast, the factor scores in the original PCA analysis combine both mean and variance attributes, standardized by the amount of consensus in the scores, and so can be called "scale-loaded".

4. These scores are broadly consistent with principles of psychophysics because they remove variance based on individual differences in the mean or "modulus" of each person's judgments (Stevens, 1975).

Oct.1, 2008

#### Job Analysis Test (JAT) Items:

Instructions: Use all your knowledge, experience, and expertise to indicate how *frequently* each of the following tasks is performed by Soldiers at the E4 level (fully functional at skill level 10) in your occupation in a combat zone. Please use the following scale to rate how frequently most Soldiers in your occupation perform each task. Be sure to answer each question even if you have never deployed to a combat zone. Record your rating next to each item.

- 1. Secure the scene of a traffic accident
- 2. Operate a roadblock or a checkpoint
- 3. Supervise the establishment and operation of a dismount point

#### Employee Attribute Test (EAT) Items:

Instructions: Use all your knowledge, experience and expertise to indicate how *IMPORTANT* the Army believes each of the following characteristics is to success in your occupation at the E4/E5 level in a combat zone. Please use the following scale to rate the importance of each characteristic, and record your rating next to each item. Be sure to read the description of each characteristic and answer each question even if you have never deployed to a combat zone.

- 1. Conscientiousness/Dependability. The tendency to be trustworthy, reliable, and willing to accept responsibility.
- 2. General Cognitive Aptitude. The overall ability to understand information, identify problems & solutions, and learn.
- 3. Emotional Stability. Acts rationally and displays a calm mood



For both types of OJTs, the correlations between the component scores, job knowledge, and cognitive ability were statistically significant, (p < .05, 1-tail), as hypothesized, although the OJT component score correlations with job knowledge were significant at much more stringent levels, (p < .001).

The demonstration that the EAT component scores correlated with career attitudes (CA) (r [CA,EAT component] = .14, p < .01,  $\rho = .19$ ) contrasts with the non-significant correlations of career attitudes with the conventional job knowledge (JK) measures, (r [CA,JK] = -.01, ns), and with AFQT, (r [CA,AFQT] = -.09, ns). These results provide the first evidence that the OJT method may assess knowledge that reflects incumbent career motivation and is acquired informally, as implied by tacit knowledge theory (Sternberg & Wagner, 1993).



Oct 2 2008